

# REVUE ROUMAINE DE PHILOSOPHIE

---

Tome 64

N° 2

Juillet–Décembre 2020

---

## ABSTRACTS

### KIERKEGAARD ON THE NARRATOR AND HIS AUTHOR IN HANS CHRISTIAN ANDERSEN'S *ONLY A FIDDLER*

HELENA BŘEZINOVÁ

**Abstract.** Kierkegaard's literary debut was a lengthy and scathing review of Hans Christian Andersen's novel *Only a Fiddler* (1837), titled *From the Papers of One Still Living* (1838). This article focuses on Kierkegaard's treatment of the narrative mode in Andersen's novel, examining Kierkegaard's scrutiny of the novel's Er-narrator in particular. He deems the disembodied Er-narrator to be inappropriately subjectivized and severely lacking in authority. Kierkegaard's dissection of Andersen's narrator demonstrates his refined understanding of how the narrative mode impacts the reader. Furthermore, Kierkegaard's critique proves well in line with Lubomír Doležel's understanding of the authentication function in fiction. Lastly, the article briefly examines the narrative mode employed in Kierkegaard's own writings. It is important to note that his work predominantly favours the Ich-form over the Er-form, which is largely missing from his oeuvre. Kierkegaard's review can thus be interpreted as indirectly corroborating the intentionality of Kierkegaard's narrative strategy: a strategy that seems to consist of limiting the narrator's authentication authority.

**Keywords:** Søren Kierkegaard; Hans Christian Andersen; *From the Papers of One Still Living*; Er-narrator; Ich-form; Lubomír Doležel; authentication function.

### EINE LITERARISCHE ANZEIGE: KIERKEGAARD UND DER ROMANTISCHE KRITIKBEGRIFF

ANA-STANCA TABARASI-HOFFMANN

**Abstract.** This article discusses the conception of authorship, readership and criticism in Søren Kierkegaard's *A literary review* (*En Litterair Anmeldelse*, 1846). Kierkegaard's view of communication is interpreted as belonging to the aesthetic paradigm of Romanticism: criticism as authorship raised to the second power. Thus, even his critique of Romanticism can be read as a continuation of Romanticism.

**Keywords:** Søren Kierkegaard; Romanticism; *A literary review*; critique; irony; Thomasine Gyllembourg.

# KIERKEGAARD'S CRITIQUE OF RELIGION WITHIN THE LIMITS OF REASON. DUTY AS LOVING PRACTICAL ACTION

SIOBHAN DOYLE

**Abstract.** Søren Kierkegaard's Christian ethics, as second ethics, identifies specific problems which arise within the limits of secular ethics, as first ethics. Kierkegaard's view of Kantian ethics is one of ambiguity: he praises Immanuel Kant's broader view of ethics which recognises the necessity of religion; and he rejects what he sees as Kant's attempt to: i) reduce religion to morality, and ii) confine faith within the limits of rationality. Kierkegaard's Christian ethics is grounded in love, as divinely commanded love. Kant would have wholeheartedly rejected Kierkegaard's definition of Christian ethics as an ethics of "commanded love". For Kant, there is no such thing as a duty to love. This apparent contradiction between Kierkegaard's and Kant's opinion of love as a proper object of a moral command can be reconciled by recognising that Kierkegaard's concept of "neighbourly love" relates directly to the Kantian concept of "willing the Good".

**Keywords:** ethics; love; morality; faith; religion; duty.

# ON THE CRITICAL RECEPTION OF SØREN KIERKEGAARD'S PHILOSOPHICAL IDEAS BY LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN

ANDRII SYNYSIA

**Abstract.** The article analyses how Kierkegaard influenced the work of Wittgenstein and substantiates the idea that the reception of the Danish thinker's writings by the Austrian philosopher was critical. The reason for the critical reception lies not only in their different philosophical traditions and historical periods, since some ethical and religious issues interested Wittgenstein no less than Kierkegaard. However, while acknowledging the latter's authority in these matters, Wittgenstein's interpretations differed significantly. The arguments made by Kierkegaard in addressing existential issues were not always convincing for Wittgenstein. The article discusses the main differences between their views on the interpretation of the paradox of thought, the role and place of the principle of individuation in philosophical systems, the specificity of the subjects, and faith as their defining characteristic. It thereby highlights the contradictions within a number of parallel concepts of their philosophical works, such as the stages on life's way and the forms of life. While not denying the importance of Kierkegaard's reasoning for understanding certain aspects of Wittgenstein's philosophy, the author emphasizes the importance of a critical reception for their substantiation.

**Keywords:** Søren Kierkegaard; Ludwig Wittgenstein; paradox of thought; principle of individuation; subject; faith; stages on life's way.

# BARTHES, AVEC KOJÈVE ET KIERKEGAARD. LE SILENCE COMME L'UTOPIE DE L'ÉCRITURE

ALEXANDRU MATEI

**Abstract.** Having spent many years in the sanatorium, fatherless in a Protestant family, gay, living alone after the death of his mother, Roland Barthes had many reasons to reflect on the dichotomy between silence and language. It is in Kierkegaard's philosophy that Barthes found a paradoxical thought of silence as suspended speech, and a dialectic of signs that best suits his vision of literature as an indefinite game, without resolution,

that is, without eschatology. If most of the references to Kierkegaard have been listed and commented on by Joseph Westfall, our study focuses on a later occurrence, in *The Mourning Diary*, which reveals a reading of *Fear and Trembling* that is much more faithful than previous references suggest. It goes without saying that the concept of silence stands at odds with the discourse of History (modern, revolutionary) or to verbal language as a system for transmitting truth. It is in this second meaning that the silence sought by Barthes finds in Kierkegaard's mysticism an important support. There are, in Barthes' work, two sets of values of silence: there is an aesthetic and political silence, a silence that allows itself to be perceived in relation to History and its discourse, its power; there is, on the other hand, a silence that is filled with gestures and signs of the body and which, in the end, borders on mystical, apophatic silence. Barthes strives to accommodate a writing to each of these two types of silence.

**Keywords:** silence; Roland Barthes; Soren Kierkegaard; Alexandre Kojève; det Almene; général.

## ATOMISM IN THE *NOVATORES* AND LATE SCHOLASTICS

ROGER ARIEW

**Abstract.** Novelty was not considered a positive epistemic value in the 17th century, so that when people were referred to as innovators (*novatores*) they were being criticized as dangerous and as holding views contrary to the sentiments and the practice of the Church, that is, as heretics and new philosophers. You can find various lists of such “novelists” at the time; the members of the list do not have much in common, except that they were implicitly or explicitly anti-Aristotelians and often also atomists. I survey the wide variety of atomism prevalent in the works of the *novatores* and some of their close contemporaries. I focus on the alchemical atomism of Étienne de Clave, the *minima naturalia* theory of Daniel Sennert's early period, the Democritean atomism (without void) of Sébastien Basso, and the corpuscularianism of René Descartes (as seen through the criticism it received from scholastics). All of these “new philosophers” can be found on a list of *novatores* at one time or another during the 17th century.

**Keywords:** early modern philosophy; atomism; scholastics; Étienne de Clave; Daniel Sennert; Sebastian Basso; Descartes.

## FRANCIS BACON ON AXIOMS, LAWS, RULES AND PRINCIPLES: AN OVERVIEW

DANA JALOBÉANU

**Abstract.** Francis Bacon is rarely mentioned in the histories of the emergence of the concept of laws of nature. His philosophy does not seem to contain a conception of laws as regularities; but he does treat the subject and has a very rich vocabulary to refer to it. The trouble is that he talks, sometimes indistinguishably, of laws, forms, principles and axioms, precepts, maxims and rules. My purpose in this article is to review and clarify some of this vocabulary and to show that Bacon's terminological struggles are philosophically interesting. I show that we can find in Bacon's works a change and evolution of this vocabulary of axioms, rules and laws; and that significant changes are happening in significant contexts, such as his attempts to define the elements of a *scientia* or the outlines of a proper inquiry. I claim that Bacon's attempts to put some order in this philosophical vocabulary read as attempts to develop a new concept of order compatible with a certain kind of conception of laws of nature.

**Keywords:** Francis Bacon; laws; axioms; rules; principles.

# THE TWO THEORIES OF INTENTIONALITY IN BRENTANO AND CHISHOLM'S ONTOLOGICAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL THESES

ION TĂNĂSESCU

**Abstract.** R. M. Chisholm interprets Brentano's theory of intentionality through the lens of two theses: the ontological thesis, according to which the intentionality of the mental designates the fact that there is an immanent object in the act; and the psychological thesis, according to which intentionality consists of the direction of the mental act toward the extra-mental object. In my paper I interpret Chisholm's and Brentano's theses on intentionality from two perspectives: intentionality as the most salient distinguishing feature separating the mental from the physical (Chisholm's ontological thesis), and intentionality as a theory of the way in which mental acts with their content are related to extra-mental but theoretically-constructed objects of physics (Chisholm's psychological thesis). Thus, an important issue of my paper is also to show that Chisholm's well-known ontological and psychological theses on Brentanian intentionality rest on presuppositions that do not fit the program of Brentanian psychology.

**Keywords:** psychology; natural science; intentionality; R. M. Chisholm's ontological thesis; R. M. Chisholm's psychological thesis.

## DAS FAKTUM DER ERKENNTNIS UND DIE GÜLTIGKEIT DER ERKENNTNIS: ZWISCHEN CHISHOLM UND NELSON Ein Diskussionsbeitrag

DRAGAN JAKOVLJEVIĆ

**Abstract.** This article starts from the discussion of the relation between the so-called egological statements about own psychological attitudes and the classical epistemological question about the justification of knowledge, i.e. its pretension to validity, as found in actors such as Nelson, Ducasse, Chisholm. An analysis of their central thesis is given, that, in cases of such statements, to justify their validity it is enough to point to the very fact of the givenness of certain psychological attitudes, such as belief, desire, feeling (of pain, etc.). The second part of the discussion considers the fact of the knowledge and the epistemic characteristics that are connected to it. By drawing from Cassirer, the author points to the risk of accepting the dogmatism of the Common-Sense-Philosophy with the background of an optimistic theory of the cognitive mind. In the concluding part of the article, a question is opened about different perspectives on the interpretation of knowledge – the internalistic and the externalistic. Along with this, their comparative interpretative capacities are being examined, while pointing to the difference between the knowledge as an object of scientific research and the knowledge as it is being experienced by the subjects of cognition. The thesis that the possibility of knowledge is not a problem but, actually, a fact (Nelson), makes sense as a counterpoise to the radical scepticism and fallibilism.

**Keywords:** possibility of knowledge; justification of knowledge; egological statements; psychological attitudes; perspectives on the interpretation of knowledge.

## L'ARGUMENTATION PAR ANALOGIE. REPÈRES LOGIQUES

MARIUS DOBRE

**Abstract.** In the first part, the article presents some of the most important meanings of the concept of analogy from a logical point of view. The second part highlights a few vulnerabilities of argumentation by analogy as inductive argumentation.

**Keywords:** inductive argumentation; logical schemes of analogy; vulnerability of argumentation by analogy.

# L'UN ET LE MULTIPLE : LE CAS DE LA RHÉTORIQUE

CONSTANTIN SALAVASTRU

**Abstract.** A single discipline according to the ancient Greek and Latin tradition, rhetoric is today an expanding field characterized by the diversity of its specific forms of manifestation. We analyze the relationship between the idea of rhetoric as an image of the discursive “whole” and its contextual embodiments in different areas of discursive practice. As discourse of power or plea for justice, as academic eloquence or advertising slogan, as letter of friendship – all hypostases of rhetoric –, such discursive manifestations reveal the interesting relationship which the mother-discipline maintains with the rebel daughters which have run away from home!

**Keywords:** rhetoric; power; truth; justice; advertising.